



**By email to:**

[planningconsultations-sty@cne-siar.gov.uk](mailto:planningconsultations-sty@cne-siar.gov.uk)

Comhairle Nan Eilean Siar - Stornoway  
Sandwick Road  
Stornoway  
HS1 2BW

Longmore House  
Salisbury Place  
Edinburgh  
EH9 1SH

Enquiry Line: 0131-668-8716  
[HMConsultations@hes.scot](mailto:HMConsultations@hes.scot)

Our case ID: 300072796  
Your ref: 24/00123/PPW

22 May 2024

Dear Comhairle Nan Eilean Siar

The Town and Country Planning (Environmental Impact Assessment) (Scotland) Regulations 2017

Monan Wind Farm - Replacement of three operational turbines at Monan Wind Farm with three turbines of 86m to tip and associated infrastructure  
EIA Report

Thank you for your consultation which we received on 24 April 2024. We have considered it and its accompanying EIA Report in our role as a consultee under the terms of the above regulations and for our historic environment remit. Our remit is world heritage sites, scheduled monuments and their setting, category A-listed buildings and their setting, and gardens and designed landscapes (GDLs) and battlefields in their respective inventories.

You should also seek advice from your archaeology and conservation advisors for matters including unscheduled archaeology and category B and C-listed buildings.

### **Our Advice**

We have reviewed the information received and do not consider that the proposal would have any significant impacts on heritage assets within our remit. We therefore do not wish object to the proposal. Our detailed comments are in the Annex to this letter.

Our comments should be treated as a material consideration, and this advice should be taken into account in your decision making. Our view is that the proposals do not raise historic environment issues of national significance and therefore we do not object. Our decision not to object should not be taken as our support for the proposals. This application should be determined in accordance with national and local policy on development affecting the historic environment, together with related policy guidance.



## Further Information

This response applies to the application currently proposed. An amended scheme may require another consultation with us.

Guidance about national policy can be found in our 'Managing Change in the Historic Environment' series available online at [www.historicenvironment.scot/advice-and-support/planning-and-guidance/legislation-and-guidance/managing-change-in-the-historic-environment-guidance-notes/](http://www.historicenvironment.scot/advice-and-support/planning-and-guidance/legislation-and-guidance/managing-change-in-the-historic-environment-guidance-notes/). Technical advice is available through our Technical Conservation website at [www.engineshed.org](http://www.engineshed.org).

Please contact us if you have any questions about this response. The officer managing this case is Adrian Lee who can be contacted by phone on 07500 579626 or by email on [adrian.lee@hes.scot](mailto:adrian.lee@hes.scot).

Yours faithfully

**Historic Environment Scotland**



## ANNEX

### Our Detailed Comments

#### Background

We understand that consent was granted in 2008 on the Monan Wind Farm site for three wind turbines at a maximum tip height of 86m and associated infrastructure (06/00290). We had no objection when we were consulted on that application in December 2006 (your ref: MMK/AMMK). Although we noted that all three turbines would likely be visible as part of the wider landscape backdrop to *Bunavoneadar, whaling station, Harris* (SM5362) on the approach from Tarbert, we considered that it seemed unlikely for any impact to be significant. We understand that the consent was then varied in 2012 to reduce the height of the turbines to the height of the operational scheme due to turbine supply issues for the site at that time.

#### Proposed Development

We understand that the proposed development comprises the removal and replacement of the three existing 2-bladed wind turbines of 46m to tip height at the Monan Wind Farm with three 3-bladed wind turbines with tip height of up to 86m and associated infrastructure. We note that the applicant has indicated that the new turbines would be located at close proximity to the current turbine positions and would use the majority of the existing access tracks. Electrical power generated would be fed to the existing substation on the Monan Wind Farm site via underground cables. We have not been consulted on this proposed development at the scoping stage, although we note that the developer appears to have sought a scoping opinion from you.

#### Environmental Impact Assessment Report

We note that our historic environment interests were scoped out at the scoping stage.

However, we can confirm that there are no scheduled monuments, category A-listed buildings, inventory battlefields, gardens and designed landscapes or world heritage sites within the boundaries of the proposed development. There is a scheduled monument of *Bunavoneadar, whaling station, Harris* (SM5362) c. 1km from the proposed development. Our detailed comments regarding the scheduled monument are as follows.

#### Scheduled Monument

We understand that the proposed turbines are to be sited c. 1km northeast of *Bunavoneadar, whaling station, Harris* (SM5362), which is a well-preserved early 20<sup>th</sup>



century whaling station, but the proposed turbines should be screened from the monument by the intervening topography.

This monument comprises the remains of a well-preserved whaling station built around 1900 and abandoned around 1939. The monument consists of a large slipway, landing platform, and handling areas, along with the remains of several substantial processing buildings. A brick chimney stack, one of two originally built, survives almost intact as do anchor blocks for vats, boilers, winches, and other heavy equipment. The monument is of national importance as the best-preserved example of a whaling shore station in the country. It represents one of a very small group of such stations founded around Scottish Coasts by joint British / Norwegian companies in the late 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> centuries.

The significance of the asset is vested not only in its physical remains but also in its setting, standing as a visual reminder of the complex and dynamic industrial heritage of the Hebrides through the post-medieval period into the present. The views of the whaling station on approach from the sea up Loch Bun Abahainn Eadarra and from points around the coast are key to understanding, experiencing and appreciating the site and its function as part of the maritime economy of the Western Isles and the North Atlantic more widely. The dominance of the brick chimney over the surrounding bay is also key to understanding the industrial nature of the area in early 20<sup>th</sup> century.

The proposed turbines would be sited in an elevated position c. 1km to the northeast of the monument. Though the turbines may be visible in some long-distance views of the site from the sea, they are at a sufficient distance that they will not impact on the visual relationship of the station with the surrounding coastline. The turbines are not likely to be visible from the site itself and therefore will not detract from the dominance of the industrial chimney over its immediate surroundings in the bay.

## **Our position**

Although the turbines may be visible in key views of the monument on approaches from the sea, we do not assess these impacts as significant. This assessment is consistent with our view on the previous consultation on the Monan Wind Farm site in 2006 for three wind turbines at a maximum tip height of 86m and associated infrastructure.

## **Historic Environment Scotland**

22 May 2024