



COMHAIRLE NAN EILEAN SIAR
Education and Children's Services Department

Sandwick Road, Stornoway. HS1 2BW
Rathad Shanndabhaig, Steornabhagh. HS1 2BW

Education Provision
PROPOSAL DOCUMENT – SEPTEMBER 2013

Review of Education Provision

CARINISH SCHOOL
LOCHMADDY SCHOOL
PAIBLE SCHOOL
Isle of North Uist

Roinn an Fhoghlaim is Seirbheisean Chloinne

COMHAIRLE NAN EILEAN SIAR
Education and Children's Services Department

Review of Education Provision – September 2013

PROPOSAL DOCUMENT FOR CARINISH, LOCHMADDY AND CARINISH SCHOOLS
Isle of North Uist

Index

Section:

Proposal

- 1 Introduction
- 2 Consultative Process – Summary of Process for this Proposal Document
- 3 Public Meeting
- 4 General Background to the need for a school estate review
- 5 Comhairle Aspirations
- 6 Key Factors
 - Demographic Trends and School Rolls
 - Travel
- 7 Consultation Proposal
- 8 Educational Benefits Statement
- 9 Consideration of Factors Affecting Rural Schools
- 10 Other Factors
 - Financial Information
 - Staffing
- 11 Conclusion

Appendices:

- 1. Consultees
- 2. School Rolls – Western Isles
- 3. Financial Information

Review of Education Provision: September 2013 Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools Isle of North Uist

Report by the Director of Education and Children's Services

PROPOSAL

It is proposed that:

- **Education provision at Carinish School be discontinued with effect from 26 June 2015 or such later date as the Director of Education and Children's Services shall determine following service availability of the new North Uist Primary School.**
- **Education provision at Lochmaddy School be discontinued with effect from 26 June 2015 or such later date as the Director of Education and Children's Services shall determine following service availability of the new North Uist Primary School.**
- **Education provision at Paible School be discontinued with effect from 26 June 2015 or such later date as the Director of Education and Children's Services shall determine following service availability of the new North Uist Primary School.**
- **A new North Uist Primary School be established on the existing school site at Paible, Isle of North Uist, from 13 August 2015 or such later date as the Director of Education and Children's Services shall determine following service availability of the new school and the pupils of Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools continue their education there.**
- **The catchment area of the new North Uist Primary School be extended to include the current catchment areas of Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Primary Schools.**
- **The new North Uist Primary School will include provision for statutory pre-school education.**

INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 Comhairle nan Eilean Siar aims to allocate resources in a way which will secure the best possible educational experience for pupils in the Western Isles. Implicit in this key objective is the effective deployment of resources in order to secure continuous improvement in educational achievement and attainment, and to provide better facilities in the most viable settings.
- 1.2 The Comhairle took a decision in February 2009 to undertake a community information and engagement exercise prior to bringing a further report to the Education and Children's Services Committee. The Comhairle then decided to undertake a series of Community Conversations to enable it to decide whether any schools would become the subject of a statutory consultation process.

- 1.3 The Comhairle, at its Meeting on 12 September 2013, authorised the Director of Education and Children’s Services to proceed to undertake the necessary statutory consultation with parents, staff, pupils and other interested parties affected by the proposal regarding the discontinuation of Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools as required by the Schools (Consultation)(Scotland) Act 2010.
- 1.4 This document relates to a proposal to discontinue the Primary Schools at Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible with effect from 26 June 2015 or such later date as the Director of Education and Children’s Services shall determine following service availability of the new school on the basis of the transfer of the pupils to a new North Uist Primary School on the existing school site at Paible, Isle of North Uist on 13 August 2015 or such later date as the Director of Education and Children’s Services shall determine following service availability of the new school.

CONSULTATIVE PROCESS - SUMMARY OF PROCESS FOR THIS PROPOSAL DOCUMENT

Consideration by the Education and Children’s Services Committee

- 2.1 This Proposal Document has been issued as a result of a decision approved by the Comhairle on 12 September 2013. The decision was to seek views on the proposal in this paper.

Proposal Document issued to consultees and published on Comhairle Web-site

- 2.2 A copy of this document will be issued free of charge to the consultees listed at appendix 1, and it will also be published on the Comhairle website: www.cne-siar.gov.uk

Publication of advertisement in local newspapers

- 2.3 An advertisement will be placed in the Stornoway Gazette, the West Highland Free Press and Am Pàipear. In addition, there will be announcements related to the consultation process on Radio nan Gaidheal.

Length of Consultation period

- 2.4 An advertisement will be placed in local newspapers on Thursday, 26 September 2013. The consultation will thereafter run until close of business on 22 November 2013, which includes a period of 32 school days.

Public meetings

- 2.5 Public meetings will be held on Tuesday, 29 October and Wednesday, 30 October 2013, the details of which are given in this Document.

Involvement of HMle

- 2.6 When the Proposal Document is published, a copy will also be sent to HMle by the Comhairle. HMle will also receive a copy of any relevant written representations that are received by the Comhairle from any person during the consultation period or, if HMle agree, a summary of them. HMle will further receive a summary of any oral representation made to the Comhairle at the public meeting that will be held and, as available (and so far as otherwise practicable), a copy of any other relevant documentation. HMle will then prepare a report on the educational aspects of the proposal not later than 18 December 2013 after the Comhairle has sent them all representations and documents as mentioned above. In preparing their report, HMle may visit the affected schools and make such reasonable enquiries of such people there, as they consider appropriate, and may make such reasonable enquiries of other people as they consider appropriate.

Preparation of Consultation Report

- 2.7 The Comhairle will review the proposal having regard to the HMle Report, written representations that it has received and oral representations made to it by any person at the public meeting. It will then prepare a Consultation Report. This report will be published in electronic and printed formats and will be advertised in local newspapers. It will be available on the Comhairle web-site and from Comhairle Offices, as well as at the affected schools, free of charge. Anyone who has made written representations during the consultation period will also be informed about the report. The report will include a record of the total number of written representations made during the consultation period, a summary of the written representations, a summary of the oral representations made at the public meeting, the Authority’s response to the HMle Report as well as any written or oral representations it has received, together with a copy of the HMle Report and any other relevant information, including details of any alleged inaccuracies and how these have been handled. The Report will also contain a statement explaining how the Comhairle complied with the requirement to review the proposal in light of the HMle Report and representations (both written and oral) that it received. The Consultation Report will be published at least 3 weeks prior to the Comhairle making a decision.

Decision

2.8 This Consultation Report together with any other relevant documentation will be considered by the Education and Children’s Services Committee on 4 February 2014 who will make a recommendation. This recommendation will then be subject to the approval of the Comhairle on 13 February 2014.

Scottish Ministers Call-in

2.9 In the event that the Comhairle decides to close and of the schools at this stage, it is required to notify the Scottish Ministers of that decision and provide them with a copy of the Proposal Document and Consultation Report in accordance with the Schools (Consultation)(Scotland) Act 2010 within 6 working days of the decision being made. The Scottish Ministers have a 6 week period from the date of that final decision to decide if they will call-in the proposal. If the Scottish Ministers call-in the proposal they may refuse to consent to the proposal or grant their consent to the proposal subject to conditions or unconditionally. Within the first 3 weeks of the 6 week period, the Scottish Ministers will take account of any relevant representations made to them by any person. Until the outcome of the 6 week call-in process has been notified to the Comhairle, the Comhairle will not proceed to implement the proposal.

Note on Corrections

2.10 If any inaccuracy or omission is discovered in this Proposal Document either by the Comhairle or any person, the Comhairle will determine if relevant information has been omitted or, if there has been an inaccuracy. The Comhairle will then take appropriate action which may include the issue of a correction or the reissuing of the Proposal paper or the revision of the timescale for the consultation period if appropriate. In that event, relevant consultees and HMIe will be advised.

PUBLIC MEETINGS

3.1 Public meetings will be held to discuss the proposal. Anyone wishing to attend a public meeting is invited to do so. The meeting will be convened by the Comhairle and will be addressed by representatives of the Education and Children’s Services Department and other senior officers of the Comhairle.

3.2 The meetings will be an opportunity to:

- Hear more about the proposal
- Ask questions about the proposal
- Have the views of all stakeholders recorded so that they can be taken into account as part of the Proposal process.

3.3 Arrangements for the meetings are as follows:

Venue	Date	Time
Lochmaddy School	Tuesday, 29 October 2013	7.30pm
Paible School	Wednesday, 30 October 2013	5.30pm
Carinish School	Wednesday, 30 October 2013	7.30pm

3.4 A note will be taken at the meeting of questions and views. This note will be published on the Comhairle web-site, and a copy will be made available on request. The meetings will also be recorded.

3.5 The Comhairle will also take into consideration any written or electronic submissions on the proposal, which may be submitted to schoolconsultations@cne-siar.gov.uk or to the **Chief Executive at the Comhairle Offices, Sandwick Road, Stornoway HS1 2BW, to arrive not later than 5.00pm on Friday, 22 November 2013.**

GENERAL BACKGROUND TO THE NEED FOR A SCHOOL ESTATE REVIEW

4.1 The Comhairle is charged to provide its statutory services as effectively and efficiently as possible. It is therefore necessary to be strategic in the delivery of education to ensure Best Value. School rolls in the authority as a whole have been falling year on year for the last thirty years and, as far as can be seen, this is a continuing trend. There are more buildings in the school estate than are considered necessary for the delivery of high quality education.

- 4.2 The recent education review identified a number of factors relating to the education provision within the Western Isles. These can be briefly stated-
- a) There were too many schools for the size of the pupil population.
 - b) Many schools were costly to maintain.
 - c) Many schools were neither designed nor equipped to offer high quality education across all aspects of the curriculum in the 21st century.
 - d) The pupil costs, relating as they do to pupil numbers, were very high.
 - e) The staffing costs, relating to pupil numbers, were very high.
 - f) Education Grant-Aided Expenditure, with pupil numbers as a primary indicator, continues to diminish in line with falling pupil numbers, having a severe impact on the Comhairle's budget.
- 4.3 Population and pupil decline continue to provide significant challenges to education provision in the Western Isles.
- 4.4 The requirements which have to be addressed by the Comhairle are-
- a) to provide a quality education service for children and young people aged 3-18.
 - b) to adjust the school provision within the Western Isles to reflect the present and projected pupil numbers.
 - c) to enhance the facilities available to all pupils aged 3-18; and
 - d) to bring the costs of the education provision to a level which the Comhairle can afford while aspiring to enhance the quality of Learning and Teaching environments.

COMHAIRLE ASPIRATIONS

- 5.1 In order to address the requirements in a rational and fair way throughout the Western Isles the Comhairle is;
- a) committed to providing the highest quality of educational opportunity and experience for school pupils within available resources;
 - b) committed to consultation procedures which communicate accurate information about the benefits of change;
 - c) committed to change which is carefully planned, adequately resourced, and phased appropriately;
 - d) committed to ensuring that receiving schools are properly resourced to provide a better environment for learning and teaching;
 - e) committed to the view that projects linked to the School Estate Review should have priority within its programmes of Capital and Revenue expenditure.
- 5.2 This will be done by –
- reducing surplus capacity in schools
 - improving the condition and suitability rating of schools through capital projects and addressing maintenance issues
 - improving property flexibility
 - meeting statutory requirements of Disability Discrimination Act 2006 (DDA)
 - building new schools.
- 5.3 The Scottish Government issued its 'Building Better Schools: Investing in Scotland's Future' document in September 2009. The document sets out the Government's aspirations for the school estate and states:
- "All children and young people will be educated in, and community users will use, schools that are 'fit for purpose' in terms of condition, suitability and sufficiency;
 - Schools are well-designed, accessible, inclusive learning environments that inspire and drive new thinking and change and which support the delivery of high quality educational experiences through *Curriculum for Excellence*;
 - Schools are integral parts of the communities they serve, with pupils making use of community facilities and communities accessing school facilities;
 - Schools accommodate and provide a range of services, activities and facilities that make a difference to people's health and well being, to sustaining economic growth and to the strength and vibrancy of communities;

- A sustainable school estate whose design, construction and operation is environmentally and energy efficient; contributes directly to delivering the year-on-year reductions in greenhouse gas emissions introduced by the Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009, which is resilient to the impact of climate change and which leads by example in matters of environmental performance;
- A school estate that is efficiently run and that delivers maximum value for money;
- A school estate which is flexible and responsive - both to changes in demand for school places and to learners' and teachers' requirements and wishes, and where the beneficial impact of change is maximised by thorough consultation and engagement with users and stakeholders”.

5.4 In order to maintain an adequate level of provision it is necessary for the Comhairle to allocate its resources in a way which will secure the best possible education for pupils in the Western Isles. Implicit in this objective is the effective deployment of resources in order to provide better educational facilities. The Comhairle believes that it must continue to look at the current provision of education in the Western Isles, to plan ahead and to determine the best way in which educational facilities of a higher standard can be made available for present and future generations.

5.5 The advantages of rationalising provision can be summarised as follows -

- a) More efficient and effective deployment and development of staff and more effective flexibility in grouping children for learning and teaching.
- b) There is an opportunity for reinvestment of savings from the School Estate Review in the Education Service to ensure all children and pupils are educated in buildings that are well designed and accessible, with inclusive learning environments.
- c) There is the opportunity to achieve better management of school buildings by making better use of capacity to integrate additional support needs and pre-school within mainstream provision.
- d) There is the opportunity to adapt buildings to take account of demographic change by providing more flexibility in accommodation usage within schools.
- e) There is the opportunity of overseeing the construction of new schools to meet modern curricular needs and to replace older and poorer school building stock.
- f) In terms of the Comhairle's Asset Disposal Policy provided the land is not required for housing community interest is then ascertained. The Comhairle has recently agreed to transfer Knock, Balallan and Bragar Schools to the local communities.
- g) There is the opportunity of disposing of buildings to raise Capital Receipts for the Comhairle.

KEY FACTORS

Demographic Trends and School Rolls

- 6.1 The total school rolls have fallen steadily since Comhairle nan Eilean Siar was established as a new Education Authority in 1975. Predictions made about falling school rolls in the past have proved to be accurate and therefore have been reliable. The total roll (primary and secondary) thirty years ago was 6,246 while in September 2013 this had fallen to 3,447.
- 6.2 As pupil population has declined, the level of funding has also fallen in line with that decline. This has the effect of making the current pattern of provision an unsustainable one, particularly in the context of the necessity to make major cutbacks at present and for the foreseeable future.

Travel

- 6.3 A key factor is the travel implications for pupils which would arise in the event of rationalisation-
 - a) The distances that pupils have to travel to and from school are clearly important in any assessment of the requirement to make relevant and appropriate provision. In addition, distances of themselves have to be set in the context of road conditions and the time that such travelling takes.
 - b) The Comhairle Policy states that the Comhairle will aim to limit all journeys for primary pupils to no more than 40 minutes. However, on occasions where pupils are living in a remote location which would mean that their journey to school was longer than the policy stated, reasonable steps would be taken to minimise their journey time. When discontinuing a school the Comhairle seeks to limit any primary pupil's journey to school to not more than 30 minutes. The Comhairle will look at solutions, in the context of the tendering specification of new bus service contracts from April 2015, which would reduce travelling time for pupils from the more distant areas by using minibuses and/or taxis to take pupils to identified pick-up points so that travel to and from school would be as direct as possible.

CONSULTATION PROPOSAL

7.1 It is proposed that:

- Education provision at Carinish School be discontinued with effect from 26 June 2015 or such later date as the Director of Education and Children's Services shall determine following service availability of the new North Uist Primary School.
- Education provision at Lochmaddy School be discontinued with effect from 26 June 2015 or such later date as the Director of Education and Children's Services shall determine following service availability of the new North Uist Primary School.
- Education provision at Paible School be discontinued with effect from 26 June 2015 or such later date as the Director of Education and Children's Services shall determine following service availability of the new North Uist Primary School.
- A new North Uist Primary School be established on the existing school site at Paible, Isle of North Uist, from 13 August 2015 or such later date as the Director of Education and Children's Services shall determine following service availability of the new school and the pupils Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools continue their education there.
- The catchment area of the new North Uist Primary School be extended to include the current catchment areas of Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Primary Schools.
- The new North Uist Primary School will include provision for statutory pre-school education.

EDUCATIONAL BENEFITS STATEMENT

Affected Schools

Carinish School

8.1 The roll of Carinish Primary School has decreased from 28 pupils in 2006 to 12 in the current session and they are accommodated in one class. The school has capacity for 73 pupils. The school was assessed as Condition B in the 2013 school estates survey. Since 2011/12 there have been no placing requests into Carinish School and two placing requests out of Carinish School.

8.2 The catchment areas for Carinish Primary School include the villages of Carinish and the surrounding communities of Ardnasturban, Balaglas, Baleshare, Baymore, Broad Island, Blackpoint, Carinish Carnach, Clachan, Claddach Baleshare, Claddach Carinish, Gearradubh, Grimsay Kallin, Kennary, Knockquien, Lameric, Langass, Locheport, Scotvein, Sidinish, Yellow Point.

Lochmaddy School

8.3 The roll of Lochmaddy Primary School has increased from 8 in 2006 to 22 in the current session and they are accommodated in two multi-stage English medium class groups. The school has capacity for 50 pupils. The school was assessed as Condition B in the 2013 school estates survey. Since session 2011/12 there have been three placing requests into Lochmaddy School.

8.4 The catchment area for Lochmaddy School include the villages of Lochmaddy, Blashaval, Cheesebay, Clachan Sands, Hoebeg, Lochmaddy, Lochportain, Minish, Newton Ferry, Sponish, Strumore, Ahmor, and Strombane.

Paible School

8.5 The roll of Paible School has decreased from 51 in 2006 to 39 pupils in the current session and they are accommodated in two multi stage Gaelic medium class groups and one multi-stage English medium group. The school has a capacity for 199 pupils. The school was assessed as Condition B in the 2013 school estates survey. Since session 2011/12 there has been one placing request into Paible School and two placing requests out of Paible School.

8.6 The catchment areas for Paible Primary School include the villages of Paible, Ardheisker, Baleloch, Balemartin, Balemor, Balranald, Bayhead, Claddach Illeray, Claddach Kirkibost, Claddach Knockline, Claddach Kyles, Commitee Road End Houses, Dusary, Hastin, Horisary, Hosta, Hougharry, Knockintorran, Knockline, Kyles Paible, Paiblesgarry, Scolpaig, Tigharry, Claddach Vallay, Grenitote, Griminish, Malaclete, Middlequarter, Sollas, Island of Berneray.

North Uist School

8.7 It is proposed that a new North Uist School will be established on the current Paible School site and be operational from August 2015 or such later date as the Director of Education and Children's Services shall determine following service availability of the new school. The new school will have capacity for 100 primary pupils in addition to provision for statutory pre-school education. The new school will service all of North Uist which includes the current catchment areas of Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools. In session 2015/16 it is anticipated that the new school will have an approximate pupil population of 73 primary pupils divided into 2 English medium and 2 Gaelic medium classes with approximately 4 full-time teachers. Included in the staffing will be a Headteacher with a teaching commitment with cover for management release time, and a Principal Teacher as the roll is over the 65 threshold.

8.8 There is no nursery provision provided at Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools. Currently, pre-school children in the Lochmaddy catchment area have a choice of attending Saoghal Beag or Dunsellar Pre-school provision. It is proposed that the new North Uist School will include statutory pre-school education provision. Current information indicates that there are currently 24 pre-school children in the North Uist catchment area and, of these, 3 are registered in Balivanich, 17 in Saoghal Beag Nursery and 4 in Croileagan Dhunsgealair.

Learning environment

8.9 The pupils from **Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Primary Schools** will benefit from the enhanced learning environments of a new build school. These will include spacious play areas, and a multi-use games area, and an artificial playing surface. The school will also have a dedicated library, general purpose room, and a modern equipped gym hall.

8.10 The transfer to a school with a larger pupil roll will have social and educational benefits, with increased curricular and extra curricular opportunities. A larger pupil population will enable greater flexibility in grouping children for learning and teaching. There will also be greater flexibility in the deployment of staff to meet the learning needs of pupils. Pupils from Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Primary Schools will be able to benefit from all of these facilities and the enhanced opportunities they bring to their teachers who are aiming to deliver the key elements of the Curriculum for Excellence. Staff from Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Primary Schools will benefit from additional Continuing Professional Development (CPD) opportunities to be gained by working and learning with a larger range of teaching colleagues. A larger staff will offer a wider range of expertise resulting in increased opportunities for sharing practice and more collegiate support. A likely effect of the proposal would be to create effective teaching sets at all stages which would sit well within the Government class size guidelines.

- **Information and Communication Technology (ICT)**

The pupils of Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools would have access to a more extensive range of ICT resources in the proposed move to a new build school. Each classroom in the new school will have an interactive whiteboard with an integrated Learning Wall.

- **Additional Support Needs**

The new North Uist School will have enhanced facilities to cater for the needs of all children, including those with additional support needs.

- **Gaelic Medium Education**

Gaelic Medium provision will be available which is currently not the case at Lochmaddy School.

Pre-school provision

8.11 At present there are no pre-school facilities in **Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools**. Pre-school provision in North Uist is currently served by Croileagan Dhunsgealair, Saoghal Beag Nursery and Balivanich Primary School. Having pre-school children on the same site is educationally advantageous as it creates an environment more suited to joint working and contributes to an enhanced transition for all pupils. It also provides greater opportunities for supporting the early stage of Curriculum for Excellence.

Accessibility of premises

8.12 Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools are not compliant with the requirements of Disability Discrimination Act 2005 (DDA). The new North Uist School will be fully DDA compliant.

Capacity

8.13 **Carinish School** has a capacity for 73 pupils but is currently utilising 16% of that. **Lochmaddy School** has a capacity for 50 pupils and is currently utilising 44% of that. **Paible School** has a capacity of 199 and is currently using 20% of that. The projected roll of the **new North Uist School** in 2015 is 73 primary pupils and it is anticipated that 73% of its capacity will be utilised.

Extra Curricular Activities

8.14 There are no extra curricular activities currently at any of the schools. However, pupils do participate in a number of community based after-school activities as detailed in Section 8.15.

Likely effect on the local community

8.15 **Lochmaddy, Carinish and Paible Schools** are mainly utilised by parents for events linked to the schools such as parent council meetings, school concerts and activities related to curricular matters. The schools are also used occasionally by community groups. The local communities have access to community halls in the villages of Lochmaddy and Carinish. In Paible groups will be able to access the new school.

The following are the school lets for the period 2012-14:

Carinish School	Lochmaddy School	Paible School	
Feis classes, annual Oct-April	Birthday party WRI Weekly Mother and Toddler group.	North Uist Bowling Club North Uist football Club Free Church Continuing Lord's Day Observance Society	Bring and Buy Sale Archaeological Meeting Feis Boys' football Athletics Club

8.16 In terms of the Comhairle's Asset Disposal Policy, provided the land is not required for housing, community interest is then ascertained. The Comhairle has recently agreed to transfer Knock, Balallan and Bragar Schools to the local communities.

Travel

8.17 **Carinish School** is situated approximately 7 miles from the proposed site of the new school and **Lochmaddy School** is situated approximately 13 miles from the proposed site of the new school. All pupils from the current Carinish and Lochmaddy catchment area will be entitled to free transport. The pupils from **Paible** catchment area will continue with the current arrangement.

8.18 The Comhairle Policy states that the Comhairle will aim to limit all journeys for primary pupils to no more than 40 minutes. However, on occasions where pupils are living in a remote location which would mean that their journey to school was longer than the policy stated, reasonable steps would be taken to minimise their journey time. When discontinuing a school the Comhairle seeks to limit any primary pupil's journey to school to not more than 30 minutes. The Comhairle will look at solutions, in the context of the tendering specification of new bus service contracts from April 2015, which would reduce travelling time for pupils from the most distant areas by using minibuses and/or taxis to take pupils to identified pick-up points so that travel to and from school would be as direct as possible.

Staff transfer

8.19 All staff transfers will be conducted under existing Comhairle policies and procedures with attempts being made, where possible, to minimise any additional distance that they may require to travel. Where necessary, any aspect of the implementation of these proposals that impacts on staff will result in consultation with the relevant trade unions and the individuals concerned.

Consequences of the Preferred Option

8.20 The proposal will result in pupils at Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools attending a building that is modern and better designed for the delivery of a 21st Century curriculum. The staff, parent councils and community will be fully consulted on the development of plans for the integration of pupils from Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible School into a new North Uist School.

Summary of Educational Benefits

8.21 Attending a school with a larger roll will have educational benefits for pupils currently at Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools. The learning opportunities and experience will be significantly widened. The specific benefits are listed below:

- increased opportunities for pupils, both curricular and extra-curricular activities;

- greater flexibility in grouping children for learning and teaching;
- greater flexibility in the deployment of staff to meet learning needs;
- a larger staff will offer a wider range of expertise resulting in increased opportunities for sharing effective practice, more collegiate support and a wider range of learning and teaching approaches; and
- more management support to promote school improvement.

8.22 Pupils and parents of **Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools** would have access to a modern educational establishment, which is fully equipped and designed to meet the needs of pupils and fully deliver a Curriculum for Excellence. There is an opportunity for the pupils, staff and parents of all schools to benefit from working together to ensure that the very best quality of learning and teaching is available to all pupils, irrespective of their needs or abilities.

Conclusion

8.23 Based on the Educational Benefits Statement, the Comhairle is persuaded that the proposal would result in the Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible School pupils attending a school building which is modern and designed for the delivery of a 21st Century curriculum.

CONSIDERATION OF FACTORS AFFECTING RURAL SCHOOLS

9.1 In terms of Section 12 of the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010, Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools are Very Remote Rural Schools. Consequently, special regard has been given to the following factors in the preparation of this document.

Viable Alternatives to Closure

9.2 The only alternative options for the future provision of education for pupils in **Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools** are to:

- a) maintain the status quo. This option does not provide educationally beneficial class groupings which would enrich the learning experiences.
- b) make the school buildings Disability Discrimination Act 2005 (DDA) compliant. This option does not provide the means to increase the roll or significantly improve the physical and learning environment of the building and play areas.
- c) locate the new North Uist School on site of the current Lochmaddy School or Carinish School. The option does not provide an adequate site for the provision of a new build primary school compliant with the specification of other new build schools in the Western Isles on either site.
- d) incorporate Carinish and Paible Schools within the current Lochmaddy Primary School. This option does not provide adequate capacity to provide accommodation and facilities for the projected pupil population.
- e) incorporate Lochmaddy and Paible Schools within the current Carinish Primary School. This option does not provide adequate capacity to provide accommodation and facilities for the projected pupil population.
- f) incorporate Carinish and Lochmaddy Primary Schools within the current Paible School. Paible School was built in the 1960s and the redevelopment of the school to meet the standards of new build schools is not considered cost effective. This proposal was the subject of a community conversation where there was unanimous support for a new school building.
- g) build the new North Uist School in a location other than Paible. This option has been robustly explored and on a range of factors the site at Paible has been evaluated as the most suitable site for the new school with regard to cost, site, construction and educational benefits.

9.3 The options above are not considered to be viable.

Likely Effects on the Local Community

9.4 As detailed in section 8.15 of this proposal document it is believed that there will be no negative effect on the local communities. However, the educational and social benefits of a new school will provide a significant community resource providing many benefits to the local community. The local communities have access to community halls in the villages of Lochmaddy and Carinish. In Paible groups will be able to access the new school.

9.5 The Outer Hebrides Migration Study 2008, identified key factors of sustainable communities which included sustainable employment, private sector led economic diversity, housing provision, self determination, clean energy. It is not believed that the discontinuation of primary education at Lochmaddy Primary would significantly impact on the identified key factors needed for sustainable communities.

- 9.6 In terms of the Comhairle's Asset Disposal Policy, provided the land is not required for further Comhairle use or affordable housing, community interest is then ascertained. The Comhairle has recently agreed to transfer Knock, Balallan and Bragar Schools to the local communities following the submission of a financial offer and Business Plan compliant with the requirements of the Disposal of Land by Local Authorities (Scotland) Regulations 2010.

Likely Effect Caused by any Different Travelling Arrangements that may be required in Consequence of the Proposal

- 9.7 As detailed in section 8.16 of this proposal document, Lochmaddy School is situated approximately 13 miles from the proposed site of the new school. All pupils from the current Lochmaddy catchment area will be entitled to free transport. Carinish School is situated approximately 7 miles from the proposed site of the new school. All pupils from the current Carinish catchment area will be entitled to free transport.
- 9.8 The Comhairle Policy states that the Comhairle will aim to limit all journeys for primary pupils to no more than 40 minutes. However, on occasions where pupils are living in a remote location which would mean that their journey to school was longer than the policy stated, reasonable steps would be taken to minimise their journey time. When discontinuing a school the Comhairle seeks to limit any primary pupil's journey to school to not more than 30 minutes. The Comhairle will look at solutions, in the context of the tendering of bus services in Autumn 2014, which would reduce travelling time for pupils from the most distant away areas by using minibuses and/or taxis to take pupils to identified pick-up points so that travel to and from school would be as direct as possible.

OTHER FACTORS

Financial Information

- 10.1 The financial information included at Appendix 3 in this proposal document has been developed using guidance arising from the 'Commission on the Delivery of Rural Education' published in April 2013. The total costs comprise the following headings.
- Employee Costs;
 - Building Costs;
 - School Operational Costs;
 - Transport Costs;
 - Income;
 - Central Management Support Services;
 - Capital Cost Avoidance.
- 10.2 The 2013/14 budgeted school running costs for Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools together with the estimated costs of the new North Uist School are as indicated in the table below.

2013/14 Budgeted School Running Costs	
Cost per pupil in Carinish School (based on 12 pupils)	£21,367
Cost per pupil in Lochmaddy School (based on 22 pupils)	£13,236
Cost per pupil in Paible School (based on 39 pupils)	£16,010
Estimated Cost per pupil in the new North Uist School (based on 73 pupils)	£13,403

- 10.3 The Comhairle has considered the impact the transfer of pupils from Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools to the new North Uist Primary School will have on the funding it receives from the Scottish Government through Grant Aided Expenditure (GAE) assessments and the distribution mechanism. The transfer to the North Uist School will result in the closure of three small rural schools and the opening of one new school, with a roll of 70 or greater, and consequently a reduction in the GAE for primary schools. However, this reduction will be entirely offset by the floor mechanism. The Specific Grant for Gaelic and free school meal entitlement are not expected to change if the proposal is agreed.
- 10.4 In respect of future capital expenditure the Comhairle anticipates that approximately £648K would be required to be spent on Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools to address the maintenance backlog and a further £125K required to meet DDA requirements at the schools. These costs are purely to address current building fabric and statutory deficiencies and makes no allowance for additional facilities or modifications required to make the schools suitable for future compliance with the Curriculum for Excellence requirements.

Staffing

10.5 Teaching Staff

The teaching staff complement at **Carinish School** is 2.7 FTE teacher and 0.15 FTE itinerant teachers, giving an overall complement of 2.85 FTE staff. Itinerant staff would be given revised timetables in line with the current deployment of specialist itinerant teachers.

10.6 The teaching staff complement at **Lochmaddy School** is 1.5 FTE teacher and 0.17 FTE itinerant teachers, giving an overall complement of 1.67 FTE staff. Itinerant staff would be given revised timetables in line with the current deployment of specialist itinerant teachers. The school has a shared headship arrangement with Paible School.

10.7 The teaching staff complement at **Paible School** is 3.8 FTE teacher and 0.23 FTE itinerant teachers, giving an overall complement of 4.03 FTE staff. Itinerant staff would be given revised timetables in line with the current deployment of specialist itinerant teachers. The school has a shared headship arrangement with Lochmaddy School.

Ancillary Support – Carinish School

- 10.8
- a) **Clerical**
There is a school assistant employed for 37 hours per week.
 - b) **Auxiliary**
There is one auxiliary employed for 6 hours per week.
 - c) **Instructors**
There are 3.15 hrs per week for Instructors.
 - d) **Janitor**
There is no janitorial provision.
 - e) **Cleaning Staff**
A school cleaner is employed for 10 hrs per week 40 weeks per year.
 - f) **School Meals**
A dining attendant is employed for 7.5 hrs per week 38 weeks per year and a school meal delivery driver is employed for 5 hrs per week 38 weeks per year.

Ancillary Support – Lochmaddy School

- 10.9
- a) **Clerical**
There is a school assistant employed for 37 hours per week.
 - b) **Auxiliary**
There is one auxiliary employed for 18 hours per week.
 - c) **Instructors**
There are 2.45 hrs per week for Instructors.
 - d) **Janitor**
There is no janitorial provision.
 - e) **Cleaning Staff**
A school cleaner is employed for 10 hrs per week 40 weeks per year.
 - f) **School Meals**
A cook is employed for 20 hrs per week 38 weeks per year.

Ancillary Support – Paible School

- 10.10
- a) **Clerical**
There is a school assistant employed for 37 hours per week and a classroom assistant employed for 17.17 hours per week.
 - b) **Auxiliary**
There are two auxiliaries employed for 28.25 hours per week in total.
 - c) **Instructors**
There are 7.35 hrs per week for Instructors.
 - d) **Janitor**
A janitor is employed for 37 hrs per week.
 - e) **Cleaning Staff**
Three school cleaner are employed for 11.75 hrs per week for 40 weeks per year.
 - f) **School Meals**
A cook is employed for 20 hrs per week 38 weeks per year and a kitchen assistant is employed for 10 hrs per week 38 weeks per year.

CONCLUSION

- 11.1 Based on the demographic trends and the educational benefits statement the Comhairle is persuaded that the proposal would result in the pupils of **Carinish, Lochmaddy and Paible Schools** attending a new North Uist School building which is modern and designed for the delivery of a 21st Century curriculum and has therefore agreed to proceed to statutory consultation.

APPENDIX 1 CONSULTEES

The consultation will be open to all relevant stakeholders. The groups that will be specifically consulted are:

- Parents of pupils in affected schools;
- Pupils of any affected school;
- Staff (teaching and other) of any affected school;
- Parent Councils;
- Parents of children who may attend affected schools within two years of any proposal being published;
- Trade Unions,
- Community Councils;
- Outer Hebrides Community Planning Partnership;
- Bord na Gaidhlig.

Staff and pupils will be consulted separately.

APPENDIX 2 SCHOOL ROLLS

* 2004-2012 rolls based on yearly September pupil census

** 2013 rolls are based on pre-census figures at 17/09/2013

Carinish Primary School - Rolls 2004-2013

School Year	P1	P2	P3	P4	P5	P6	P7	Total
2013/14	2	0	2	3	0	4	1	12
2012/13	0	2	3	0	5	2	5	17
2011/12	1	3	0	5	1	5	3	18
2010/11	3	0	5	1	5	3	5	22
2009/10	0	5	2	4	3	4	2	20
2008/09	5	3	5	3	5	2	4	27
2007/08	3	5	2	5	2	3	9	29
2006/07	5	2	5	2	3	8	3	28
2005/06	3	5	2	6	8	3	8	35
2004/05	5	1	4	8	2	8	7	35

Overall Percentage change over ten year period: -65.71%

Overall Percentage change over one year period: -29.41%

Lochmaddy Primary School - Rolls 2004-2013

School Year	P1	P2	P3	P4	P5	P6	P7	Total
2013/14	1	6	2	5	1	2	5	22
2012/13	5	2	4	1	1	4	0	17
2011/12	2	4	1	1	4	1	0	13
2010/11	6	1	1	5	1	0	1	15
2009/10	1	1	5	0	1	1	1	10
2008/09	1	5	0	1	1	1	0	9
2007/08	4	0	1	0	1	0	2	8
2006/07	0	1	0	1	0	2	4	8
2005/06	2	0	1	0	2	9	5	19
2004/05	0	1	1	3	8	5	3	21

Overall percentage change over ten year period: +4.8%

Overall percentage change over one year period: +29.4%

Paible Primary School - Rolls 2004-2013

School Year	P1	P2	P3	P4	P5	P6	P7	Total
2013/14	5	4	3	7	8	4	8	39
2012/13	4	5	7	8	2	8	7	41
2011/12	6	7	8	3	9	6	4	43
2010/11	7	8	4	8	5	4	4	40
2009/10	7	2	7	5	4	2	7	34
2008/09	1	8	5	4	4	6	7	35
2007/08	9	5	5	4	7	8	9	47
2006/07	5	4	4	8	8	8	14	51
2005/06	5	4	8	6	8	13	11	55
2004/05	4	8	5	6	12	9	7	51

Overall Percentage change over ten year period: -23.53%

Overall Percentage change over one year period: -4.88%

Western Isles: Summary of School Rolls in September 2013

School	P1	P2	P3	P4	P5	P6	P7	S1	S2	S3	S4	S5	S6	Pri	Sec	Total
Back	9	22	14	18	17	20	14							114		114
Balivanich	19	13	22	17	11	18	17							117		117
Bernera	2	2	0	0	2	2	4							12		12
Breascleite	7	4	7	3	5	4	6							36		36
Carinish	2	0	2	3	0	4	1							12		12
Castlebay	9	15	14	12	7	8	9	9	16	12	15	10	8	74	70	144
Daliburgh	6	14	11	13	15	14	13							86		86
Eoligarry	5	3	5	2	3	0	5							23		23
Eriskay	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							0		0
lochdar	6	6	12	14	6	7	7							58		58
Laxdale	33	24	31	33	33	31	36							221		221
Leverhulme	4	0	4	3	3	4	4							22		22
Lionel	11	6	14	11	7	17	8	7	12					74	19	93
Lochmaddy	1	6	2	5	1	2	5							22		22
Paible	5	4	3	7	8	4	8							39		39
Pairc	5	1	7	3	2	4	2							24		24
Sgoil an Rubha	23	20	20	27	23	22	27							162		162
Sgoil an Taobh Siar	11	7	7	11	4	4	15							59		59
Sgoil Lionacleit								47	45	38	67	51	31	0	279	279
Sgoil nan Loch	10	17	10	12	14	10	11							84		84
Shawbost	7	12	7	6	8	11	14							65		65
Sir E Scott	14	7	13	6	9	10	12	12	24	24	16	18	8	71	102	173
Stornoway Primary	61	66	71	41	43	59	48							389		389
Nicolson Institute								160	185	212	200	168	154	0	1079	1079
Tolsta	3	8	5	5	8	6	3							38		38
Tong	14	10	14	7	7	14	10							76		76
Uig	3	5	1	3	2	2	4							20		20
TOTALS														1898	1549	3447

**APPENDIX 3
 FINANCIAL INFORMATION**

- The annual school running cost per pupil is obtained by dividing the total school running cost by the school roll.
- The pupil numbers are based on the figures compiled for the Scottish Government census return for September 2013.
- The running costs are based on the financial model developed by COSLA following guidance issued by the Commission on Rural Education.

COMHAIRLE NAN EILEAN SIAR

Education and Children’s Services Department

FUTURE STRATEGY FOR EDUCATION PROVISION IN THE WESTERN ISLES

STATUTORY CONSULTATION: 2013

2013/14 ANNUAL COSTS	Carinish School	Lochmaddy School	Paible School	* North Uist School
DESCRIPTION				
Employee Costs	£118,491	£167,186	£282,262	£383,830
Building Costs	£16,009	£29,008	£84,420	£144,822
School Operational Costs	£10,876	£17,920	£43,540	£60,608
Transport Costs	£58,617	£31,354	£128,252	£237,223
Income	-£1,390	-£4,482	-£8,945	-£14,625
Central Management Support Costs	£53,805	£50,205	£94,859	£166,578
TOTAL RUNNING COSTS	£256,407	£291,191	£624,389	£978,436
Number of Pupils	12	22	39	73
COST PER PUPIL	£21,367	£13,236	£16,010	£13,403

* These are estimated costs.